

2011 1

Logical Leaps From Associations

MILO SCHIELD
Augsburg College
*US Rep: International Statistical Literacy Project
Director, W. M. Keck Statistical Literacy Project
Vice President, National Numeracy Network*

Aug 1, 2011
Slides at www.StatLit.org/pdf/2011SchieldASA6up.pdf

2011 2

Agenda

The distinction between association and causation is central to statistics. Yet the grammar used to describe this difference often creates confusion.

Students can't distinguish association from causation.

This paper identifies ways in which statistical associations are open to "logical leaps."

2011 3

Describing Associations by Statisticians

Statisticians: Feature abstract ideas.

Generic form:
*The correlation between X and Y is ...
X is correlated (linked, associated) with Y.*

Two-group form:
*The risk of Y is [y%] more in X than non-X.
Average Y is [y%] more in X than non-X.*

2011 4

Describing Associations by Journalists (concrete)

Two-group comparison:

1. *X has a [y%] more Y [than non-X].*

Slope comparisons:

2. *The more/bigger X, the more/bigger Y.*
2. *As X increases [by x], Y increases [by y].*
2. *For every extra x, Y increases by y.*

Active-verb association:

3. *Doing X cuts (your) Y [by y].*

2011 5

Three Logical Leaps

These journalists forms have side-effects. They all allow (encourage?) these logical leaps

1. from simultaneous to temporal
(From cross-sectional to longitudinal)
2. from group differences to individual changes.
3. from association to causation

2011 6

1) Two Group Compare

Infants who listen to classical music have higher IQ.

Logical Leap: *If you want your infant to be intelligent, then they should listen to classical music.*

1. Ignores possible common causes.
2. Ignores differences between your infant and those who live in homes that listen to classical music.

2011 7

1) Two Group Compare

Africa: Circumcised men are two to three times less likely to contract HIV [than non-circumcised men].

Logical Leap: *If you a young African male and want avoid HIV, you should get circumcised.*

1. Ignores alternate explanations.
2. May still be true.

2011 8

Internet Explorer users have lower IQs

Relaxnews - Fri, Jul 29, 2011

Using Microsoft's Internet Explorer (IE) to browse the web? Your IQ score is likely to be lower than someone using Firefox, Chrome, Safari or Opera.

A new study published by online psychometric testing company AptiQuant Psychometric Consulting Co. has found that a user's choice of web browser is related to their cognitive ability.

"There was a clear indication...that the subjects using any version of Internet Explorer ranked significantly lower on an average than others," said AptiQuant. Out of all the IE versions, "subjects using IE 8 [fared] a little better."

2011 9

2) Slope Comparisons

- 2a. **The more/bigger X, the more/bigger Y.**
- 2b. **As X increases [by x], Y increases [by y].**
- 2c. **For every extra x, Y increases by y.**

Used when X and Y are both quantitative.

More/more (as/as) comparisons of quantities.

No groups specified.

2011 10

2) As Weight ↑, Height ↑: Kids vs. Adults

The graph illustrates a positive correlation between weight and height. The y-axis is labeled 'Height' and the x-axis is labeled 'Weight'. Three icons are shown: a small child icon at the bottom left, a medium man icon in the middle, and a taller man icon at the top right. This visualizes that as weight increases, height also tends to increase.

2011 11

As X increases/decreases Between groups? Within Person?

As self-awareness increases, so does self-esteem

As bandwidth increases, new applications emerge.

Mortgages: loan values decrease as equity increases.

As group size increases, social loafing increases.

As the price of bananas increases, the quantity of apples you buy also increases.

Bus usage declines as income increases.

2011 12

3) Action Verb Associations

- Weddings **boost** mood: study.
- Expanding waist **worsens** kids' sleep apnea.

Before-after studies are possible

- Estratest **doubles** breast cancer risk
- Gene **increases** depression risk

Before-after studies are impossible.

Journalists should distinguish these two cases.

2011 13

3) Action Verb Association

“Research shows that the headgear **reduces** the concussion rate by more than 50 percent.”

8/2011 P. 41



The Costco Connection
Costco features two models of the Full90 Sports Headguards on Costco.com. You can get more information on the topic at www.Full90.com.

2011 14

3) Action-Verb Compare

Slope-compare restated with action verb:
*Each hour of television watched per day at ages 1-3 **increases** the risk of attention problems, such as ADHD, by almost 10 percent at age 7.*

Active verbs imply causation.

2011 15

Action-verbs are Common

Causation (8%): *cause, effects, results, prevents*
 Association (2%): *associate, relate, correlate,*
 Between (67%):
 37%: *Action verbs: ups, cuts, raises, increases .../*
 13%: *Two-group compare: more/less, *er*
 9%: *Sufficient: prevent, stop, end, start, kill, cure ...*
 3%: *Temporal: before/after, lead/follows ...*
 3%: *Others: due to, because of, attributed to*
 1%: *Connect: link, help*

Schild and Raymond (2009) study of 2,000 newspaper headlines that involved quantities.

2011 16

Conclusion

Statistical educators should

1. teach ways of presenting associations
2. help students distinguish from causation
3. identify related logical leaps.
4. oppose the use of active verb claims when causation is not justified.
5. formalize #4 in ASA code of ethics.

2011 17

3) Action-Verb Association

Two-group compare restated with action verb:

Two-groups: People who read home and fashion magazines are more likely to get pregnant than people who read car and hunting magazines.

Action Verb: Reading home and fashion magazines **ups** chances of getting pregnant.

Active verbs imply causation.

2011 18

2) Slope Compare

Kids: temporal association within each subject.
As kids get heavier, they tend to get taller.

Adults: Non-temporal association between groups
Heavier people tend to be taller than lighter people.

Logical leap:
Adults: temporal association within a subject.
As adults gain weight, they tend to grow taller. ☺

1. Obviously false. We know better.

2011 19

**As X Changes
Shift in Focus? Different Subjects?**

Belief that as price increases, quality improves.

Average fixed cost declines as output increases.

Black-white income gap narrows as education increases.

Standard of living actually goes up as trade increases.

The need for more roads increases as traffic increases.

'Inferior Good' purchases decrease as income increases.

2011 20

1) Two Group Compare

Kids taking Algebra in 8th grade do better in college

Logical Leap: *If you want your child to do better in college, then they should take Algebra in 8th grade.*

1. Ignores possible common cause (smarter)
2. Ignores any differences between your child and those children who take Algebra in 8th grade.

2011 21

References

Schild, M. (2010). Assessing Statistical Literacy: Take CARE in *Assessment Methods in Statistical Education*. Edited by Bidgood, Hunt and Jolliffe. P 133-152. Wiley Publishers.

Schild, M. (2006). Presenting Confounding and Standardization Graphically. *STATS Magazine*, ASA Fall 2006. pp. 14-18. Draft at www.StatLit.org/pdf/2006SchildSTATS.pdf.

Schild and Burnham (2003): Confounder-Induced Spuriousity and Reversal: Algebraic Conditions for Binary Data Using a Non-Interactive Model. ASA Proceedings of the Section on Statistical Education. [CD-ROM], 3690 – 3697. www.StatLit.org/pdf/2003SchildBurnhamASA.pdf

Utts, J. (2010): Unintentional Lies in the Media: Don't Blame Journalists for What we don't Teach. ICOTS-8. www.stat.auckland.ac.nz/~iase/publications/icots8/ICOTS8_1G2_UTTS.pdf